

OFFICIAL

APPENDIX B

GLASGOW CITY COUNCIL ANNUAL AUDIT REPORT 2022/23 - ACTION PLAN PROGRESS

Classification of Recommendations					
Grade 1: Key risks and/or significant deficiencies which are either critical to the achievement of strategic objectives or significant risks to material compliance with regulatory compliance. Consequently management needs to address and seek resolution urgently.					
Grade 2: Risks or potential weaknesses which impact on objectives and compliance, or impact the operation of a single process, and so require prompt but less urgent immediate action by management					
Grade 3: Less significant issues and/or areas for improvement which we consider merit attention but do not require to be prioritised by management.					

No.	Recommendation	Grading	Responsible Officer	Implementation Date	Management Update
1	Financial Statement Timetable Management should ensure that a realistic timetable for both financial statement production and the audit are developed. This should ensure that there is sufficient capacity within the finance team to support this alongside business as usual activities.	Grade 1	Head of Corporate Finance	June 2024	Financial statement production timetable updated in line with normal practice and production deadline achieved. Audit timetable developed in partnership with EY and progressing.
2	Financial Statement Working Papers Management should ensure that the 2023/24 financial statement working papers and technical accounting papers reflect the additional requirements for the 2022/23 audit and ensure that these are provided in line with the financial statement timetable.	Grade 1	Head of Corporate Finance	June 2024 but may require more time for some aspects	Report to FMSG and Finance Managers circulated. Working papers produced in 2023/24 were in line with 2022/23 requirements. Elements of working papers around valuation are being developed throughout the 2023/24 audit process.
3	Disclosure Checklist Management should ensure that the Code amendments are fully reflected, ideally through the completion of a disclosure checklist to ensure the financial statements remain Code compliant on an annual basis.	Grade 2	Head of Corporate Finance	Ongoing - date of finalised implementation to be agreed with audit as part of 23/24 planning arrangements	Review of Code requirements undertaken as part of 2023-24 accounts closedown.

OFFICIAL

OFFICIAL

No.	Recommendation	Grading	Responsible Officer	Implementation Date	Management Update
4	Income and expenditure recognition Management should ensure that a lessons learned review is performed of the income and expenditure errors identified through the 2022/23 audit to identify improvements and ensure they do not occur in future years.	Grade 2	Head of Corporate Finance	April 2024	Report to FMSG and Finance Managers circulated. Officers have considered the review points as part of the 2023/24 closedown.
5	Accounting for Depreciation The Council should ensure that depreciation is accounted for in line with Code requirements. This should include ensuring depreciation is charged when an asset is brought into use and ensure that asset useful lives are subject to regular review with appropriate consideration given to updated useful lived included within the asset valuation reports.	Grade 1	Head of Corporate Finance	June 2024	The Council assigns a uniform operational date of 31 March for all new build and refurbishment works, completed within a particular financial year. This is considered an efficient and pragmatic approach reflecting systems limitations and exact operational dates. As part of 2023/24 closedown the Council undertook to consider whether any major refurbishment substantially extended useful life and if so create a new asset for this.
	Bank Accounts The Council should continue to take steps to mitigate the risk of fraud from inactive accounts.				We have been working with RBS, Education, and the SW banking team to review these accounts. They are split into 3 Customer Identification Numbers (CINs) on the RBS side and the Education and SW accounts are in a separate CIN from our main accounts. We have identified those that have not been used by Education and Social Work for some time and are working to gain agreement to close them.

OFFICIAL

OFFICIAL

No.	Recommendation	Grading	Responsible Officer	Implementation Date	Management Update
6		Grade 2	Head of Customer Operations / Head of Corporate Finance	Ongoing - in line with business as usual	Accounts payable have a robust process for the adding and deletion of master data records. In addition to this, there are a number of internal controls that are in place to help mitigate any potential fraudulent activity. These controls are as follows: * segregation of roles with regards to the management of master data - only designated staff within CBS have access to approve master data records * the processing of Non-Purchase Order invoices is contained within one separate team * internal quality control document used when processing a Non-Purchase Order invoice ensuring correct bank details and preventing duplicate invoices * audit recommendation in place to ensure each Non-Purchase Order invoice has been approved by an Authorised Signatory
7	Journal Review While our audit work did not identify any indications of management override, we recommend that interim arrangements are put in place to review or authorise journals before posting and that the Council ensures that new systems include the functionality to have fully integrated control functions to ensure segregation of duties.	Grade 1	Head of Corporate Finance	Ongoing - to be discussed as part of 2023/24 audit planning	Will be considered as apart of the 2023-24 accounts audit process.

OFFICIAL

OFFICIAL

No.	Recommendation	Grading	Responsible Officer	Implementation Date	Management Update
8	Valuation Updates The Group and Council should ensure that valuations are properly assessed at the balance sheet date to reflect all information available including the latest market information. Management should ensure that City Property have details of all capital additions to assets due to be revalued in year to ensure they can be reflected in valuations.	Grade 2	Valuation and Disposals Manager (City Property) Head of Corporate Finance	June 2024	This is mainly a Finance action to ensure CP has all the relevant information available. To assist with this CP have set up regular meetings with Finance to ensure all the information is captured. CP will also track all new additions/capital expenditure information to ensure ease of access to the information for the team. Manager will track information has been requested and not received from departments ie. plans/drawings and escalate this if not received. These aspects were incorporated into the 2023-24 accounts.
9	Valuation Review City Property should implement a more formal, robust peer and supervisor review process, including but not limited to pre-emptively identifying the issues raised in this report. Management should also satisfy itself these checks have been completed in line with its responsibilities around use of specialists.	Grade 1	Valuation and Disposals Manager (City Property)	June 2024	Complete
10	Valuation Programme and Assets not Revalued Management should ensure that Group assets are included as part of the rolling asset valuation programme and assets not subject to valuation.	Grade 2	Head of Corporate Finance	June 2024	Group assets are included in the regular valuation exercise.

OFFICIAL

OFFICIAL

No.	Recommendation	Grading	Responsible Officer	Implementation Date	Management Update
11	<p>Heritage Asset Existence</p> <p>Management should extend their own existence testing performed in respect of heritage assets to ensure that the sample size is commensurate to both the volume and value of heritage assets. Confirmation of completion of this exercise alongside a summary of the work performed should be provided to central finance.</p>	Grade 2	Head of Museums and Collections	June 2024	<p>1. Review 2009 Audit Policy arrangement (Complete)</p> <p>2. Draft new audit proposal for review by GCC Finance:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * asset coverage (collection type, £ value area, in store, on display) * number of assets/audit * process: frequency, random aspect, reporting to central finance and recording process (In progress) <p>3. Factor in findings from GCC internal audit ref 2324084 (Collections Management Processes) due May/June 2024 (In progress)</p> <p>4. Facilitated E&Y audit visit to Burrell and GMRC on 14 November to locate items selected by auditor. Audit visit at Riverside and Kelvingrove. Verification from auditors on 15 November 2024 that all items were located as per records.</p> <p>5. Review inventory timescales 2025-27 to meet available internal resource (complete).</p> <p>4. Meet central finance to finalise audit process (February 2025), with document circulated in advance for review</p> <p>5. Implemented</p> <p>6. Bind into Collections Agreement contract review</p> <p>Expected date for full implementation - summer 2025.</p>

OFFICIAL

OFFICIAL

No.	Recommendation	Grading	Responsible Officer	Implementation Date	Management Update
12	<p>Heritage Asset Records</p> <p>Recognising the significance of the collections and the significant work required to catalogue in a consistent manner, management should have a clear timetable in place for completion of the cataloguing projects which take into account both resources available and the risk associated with not having a complete collection catalogue. This plan should give due consideration to what level of detail should be held, the costs associated with the project and how and when regular updates to members should be provided.</p>	Grade 1	Head of Museums and Collections	Ongoing up to 2029	<p>1. Review data in Museums Collections Documentation Policy and Plan 2024-29 (covers Museums and Library Special Collections heritage assets). Inventory work is progressing within Museums and Mitchell Special Collections areas.</p> <p>2. The difference between 'cataloguing' and 'inventory' and verify inventory baseline standards as required by each collection area has been confirmed.</p> <p>3. Preliminary Inventory projects at Mitchell Special Collections are enabling insight into processes (logistical, availability of existing data, formats etc) required to document these assets. Indicates particular complexities for each collection area. Estimate December 2025 for full representative sample to enable timescale/resource/ cost projections. Museums: Dress, Costume, Numismatics, Archaeology and Natural History (Botany, Zoology and Geology). Quantifications have been ongoing. Expected April 2025.</p> <p>4. Factor in findings from GCC internal audit 2324084 (Collections Management Processes) due May/June 2024. COMPLETE</p> <p>5. Factor in GCC Finance collections insurers insurance renewal requirements regarding Library Special Collections COMPLETE</p> <p>6. Present findings to GCC Finance and discuss, propose meeting at end April 2025, with paper circulated in advance.</p> <p>7. Agree reporting route re inventory progress with GCC as part of Collections Agreement contract review.</p>

OFFICIAL

OFFICIAL

No.	Recommendation	Grading	Responsible Officer	Implementation Date	Management Update
13	Infrastructure Assets While there remains some uncertainty around the future accounting requirements for infrastructure assets, the Council should ensure that in line with the Scottish Government request, work is undertaken to address the information deficits to ensure timely adoption of the permanent solution.	Grade 1	Executive Director of Finance	Ongoing - date of finalised implementation to be agreed with audit as part of 23/24 planning arrangements	Discussions will take place with the Auditor on additional requirements as part of the 23/24 Audit Planning process.
14	PPE Existence The Council should ensure that: * Assets owners should be assigned and reminded of their responsibilities to maintain detailed supporting records for Council assets * An annual sample check of existence of equipment is performed * An impairment assessment is performed to identify assets which may no longer be in use or may be damaged/lost, and * A review of the policy for capitalising equipment is performed to consider the approach for low value moveable equipment	Grade 1	Head of Corporate Finance	April 2024	Officers have considered the points within the report to Capital Board.

OFFICIAL

OFFICIAL

No.	Recommendation	Grading	Responsible Officer	Implementation Date	Management Update
15	RAAC Assessment and Impact on Assets Valuations The Council should ensure complete surveys of their estate as a matter of urgency to ensure all buildings impacted by RAAC are identified. The results of these surveys should then be factored into any valuation or impairment assessment performed to inform the 2023/24 financial statements with ongoing monitoring after the balance sheet date.	Grade 1	Divisional Director, Property, Housing & Major Projects Head of Corporate Finance	June 2024 (as surveys are completed)	All properties within the Education, Social Work, NRS and Corporate estate have been surveyed by the NRS Property Team, and Glasgow Life and City Property have also completed surveys of all of their portfolio of properties. Within the core GCC estate, only Whitehill Secondary School and a building at the NRS Daldowie Training Centre complex have been identified as containing RAAC. The RAAC at Whitehill Secondary School is being “managed” by the Council’s PPP partner as this building is within the PPP estate, and the building at Daldowie has been closed.
16	Common Good Fund Reporting Management should review the Common Good fund reporting to ensure that: * Updates are presented on a frequent basis to note progress in maintaining an accurate and complete common good fund asset register * The Council's policy for accounting for Common Good fund assets is review in conjunction with both legislative requirements and the latest LASAAC guidance published in 2023	Grade 2	Head of Corporate Finance / Head of Legal	December 2024	Initial review of new guidance complete, discussions with legal on going.

OFFICIAL

OFFICIAL

No.	Recommendation	Grading	Responsible Officer	Implementation Date	Management Update
17	Rights and Obligations The Council Group should ensure that the legal agreements in respect of this arrangement (the City Building Training Academy) are corrected urgently. The Council should perform lessons learned exercise to identify any other assets where the appropriate legal arrangements have not been put in place.	Grade 2	Head of Corporate Finance / Head of Legal	December 2024	The missives have now been completed in respect of the lease for the training academy which completes this action.
18	PPP Schemes and Central Documentation Storage The Council should ensure that all documentation to support financial statement balances including relevant contracts and leases are retained in a central location to ensure that are readily available both for new finance team members and to support audit requests.	Grade 1	Head of Corporate Finance	June 2024	PPP documentation available centrally.
19	SAP Outage Lessons Learned Management should ensure that appropriate disaster recovery plans are in place which include regular testing of the back ups for key systems. Disaster recovery plans should be reviewed following recent implementation to identify further areas for improvement.	Grade 1	Head of Information, Innovation and Technology	Ongoing and as agreed as part of future IT requirements	Since the SAP outage, CGI has conducted a programme of application back up and restore testing, across over 100 servers. This testing has provided assurance that back up and restores process are operating effectively and as expected. Work is continuing to progress the development of disaster recovery to support system resilience, and this is also a key focus of the Future of Digital and ICT Services (FICT) project.

OFFICIAL

OFFICIAL

No.	Recommendation	Grading	Responsible Officer	Implementation Date	Management Update
20	Monitoring the Delivery of the 2024/25 Budget The Council should establish reporting arrangements to monitor the achievement of savings within the three year budget. This should include an assessment of the return on investment against key projects.	Grade 1	Director of Financial and Business Services	Current processes will continue	The achievement of savings is reported through the detailed monitoring reports reported to Finance & Audit Scrutiny Committee. The first report will be reported at Period 4. Future Income Generation projects will be progressed and reported to the Political Oversight Group with reports to committee as required.
21	Use of Reserve Balances: Budget Support Fund The Council should set clear criteria for the use of Budget Support Fund balances and report on the use of the Fund within regular budget monitoring reports.	Grade 1	Director of Financial and Business Services	Current processes will continue	Any draw from the Budget Support Fund, including its purpose, is reported in the Monitoring Reports to CAC and FASC.
22	Longer Term Financial Strategy There is a need to translate the three year budget into a longer term strategy to model the impact of a range of risks both on the Council's reserves and the priorities set out in the Strategic Plan.	Grade 1	Executive Director of Finance	Ongoing as part of annual budget process	This will be built into the Financial Forecast process as part of the 25/26 Budget Process.
23	Budget Monitoring Reports The Council should review the content and focus of the budget monitoring reports to ensure that they reflect key indicators to monitor financial resilience and support elected member scrutiny.	Grade 2	Director of Financial and Business Services	December 2024	In progress. Any changes will be considered as a result of the survey results from the Review of Effectiveness work with FASC.
24	CIPFA Financial Management Code The FASC should consider an updated self-assessment against the Financial Management Code as part of the wider improvement actions following conclusion of the 2022/23 annual accounts.	Grade 2	Head of Corporate Finance	June 2024	In progress. Any changes will be considered as a result of the survey results from the Review of Effectiveness work with FASC.

OFFICIAL

No.	Recommendation	Grading	Responsible Officer	Implementation Date	Management Update
25	National Fraud Initiative The Council should formally agree a prioritisation of the actions related to the NFI programme internally and through engagement with Audit Scotland, as the leader of the NFI programme in Scotland.	Grade 2	Director of Financial and Business Services	Ongoing	Our approach remains to focus on those data matches categories that have the highest accuracy and are most likely to generate savings. We will proactively reach out to Audit Scotland to advise them of our progress on this basis every quarter, starting June 2024.
26	Monitoring of Investment Programme The Council should ensure that capital monitoring arrangements provide clear and concise reporting against individual programme progress and budgets.	Grade 2	Director of Financial and Business Services	December 2024	In progress. Any changes will be considered as a result of the survey results from the Review of Effectiveness work with FASC.
27	Financial Management Capacity The Council needs to critically reassess the sufficiency of its financial management capacity in the context of audit findings, the underlying financial statement control weaknesses, and the anticipated challenges going forward.	Grade 1	Director of Financial and Business Services	June 2024	Recruitment to vacant Corporate Finance posts is ongoing with regular assessment of need versus budget capacity.
28	Annual Governance Statement The Council should review the content of the Annual Governance Statement against the requirements of good practice to ensure that risks and accountability are fully explained.	Grade 2	Head of Internal Audit	Ongoing	Complete. We reviewed the AGS against best practice guidance and have updated the statement accordingly.
29	Significant Governance Actions The improvement actions in relation to the significant governance matters at City Building must be concluded at pace.	Grade 1	Director of Financial and Business Services	June 2024	Implementation of actions is continuing with oversight by a Steering Group made up of the Chief Executives of both the Council and Wheatley Group.

OFFICIAL

OFFICIAL

No.	Recommendation	Grading	Responsible Officer	Implementation Date	Management Update
30	Organisational Capacity The Council must ensure that clear roles and responsibilities are established in a robust accountability framework.	Grade 1	Director of Financial and Business Services	Ongoing in line with policies and procedures	This recommendation referred to 3 significant projects - Future of ICT, Pay & Grading and ERP Replacement. Each of these projects has its own governance arrangements which follow the council's guidelines including setting out clear roles and responsibilities. There is also regular engagement between the leads for each of the projects to ensure alignment of interdependencies.
31	The Council's self-assessment identified a range of improvements to the audit committee arrangements. Improvement actions should be adopted prior to the next committee meeting cycle.	Grade 2	Head of Internal Audit	June 2024	Full update on progress went to June FASC. In relation to the appointment of an independent member, we have explored a number of avenues to identify a suitable candidate, including placing an advertisement with a professional body. To date, we have not been successful but officers will continue to progress this.

OFFICIAL

OFFICIAL

No.	Recommendation	Grading	Responsible Officer	Implementation Date	Management Update
32	The Council should consider its performance reporting arrangements to ensure it is compliant with statutory performance indicator requirements.	Grade 1	Head of Corporate Policy and Governance	September 2024	<p>It was agreed with the Operational Performance and Delivery Scrutiny Committee that a planned and coordinated pause of the Annual Performance Plan (APR) would take place in 2023 in order to allow the new arrangements for the scrutiny of the new Strategic Plan 2023-2027 to bed in. This was an audited and planned process. The APR will be reported as planned in September 2024, fulfilling statutory performance indicator requirements.</p> <p>Link to APR on Glasgow .gov.uk website - https://www.glasgow.gov.uk/media/16490/Glasgow-City-Council-Performance-Report-2023-to-2024/pdf/Public_Performance_Report_2023_24.pdf?m=1736440677557</p> <p>This is also going to GCC WECCE in February 2025.</p>
33	The Council must prioritise the implementation of recommendations in relation to cyber security as a matter of urgency.	Grade 1	Head of Strategic Information, Innovation and Technology / Head of Internal Audit	Ongoing	Work is continuing towards completion of the Security Action Plan. Recruitment is ongoing for a Cyber Security Manager to support work in this critical function.
34	The Council should prepare an IFRS 16 implementation readiness assessment in advance of the standard coming into effect in April 2024.	Grade 2	Head of Corporate Finance	Ongoing - date of finalised implementation to be agreed with audit as part of 23/24 planning arrangements	Will be considered as apart of the 2023-24 accounts

OFFICIAL

OFFICIAL

No.	Recommendation	Grading	Responsible Officer	Implementation Date	Management Update
35	Low Emission Zone reporting The Council should ensure a review of the legislative requirements is performed to ensure that the statutory reporting requirements can be met.	Grade 2	Head of Corporate Finance	June 2024	The statutory reporting requirements for Low Emission Zone reporting were incorporated into the 2023/24 financial statements.