Item 9

24th November 2022

Glasgow City Council

Contracts and Property Committee

Report by Director of Legal and Administration

Contact: Maureen Fitzpatrick Ext: 76406

Coach and Mini-Bus Hire Framework Agreement

Tender Reference:- GCC005201CPU

Purpose of Report:

To submit details of the tenders received for the coach and mini-bus hire framework agreement (Framework) and recommend acceptance of the most economically advantageous tenders as detailed in this report.

Recommendations:

The Contracts and Property Committee is requested to approve the award of a Framework for coach and mini-bus hire to the suppliers listed below and as set out in the table within 2.4.

Allander Coaches Limited
Companies House Number – SC052213

Doigs Limited
Companies House Number – SC133128

Craig of Campbeltown Limited
Companies House Number – SC033868

Ward No(s):	Citywide: ✓
Local member(s) advised: Yes ☐ No ✓	consulted: Yes ☐ No ✓

1 Background and Tender

1.1 Glasgow City Council's ("the council's") annual budget for coach and mini-bus hire services is £840,000.

1.2 This Framework is primarily to support Education, as well as various other council departments and ALEOs, deliver a range of activities i.e. swimming lessons, educational and leisure trips, sports team requirements and events, as and when required. With the exception of swimming lessons, which will have a set timetable. All hires, plus the driver, will be requested on an ad-hoc basis.

1.3 A commodity team consisting of stakeholders from Education and the Corporate Procurement Unit (CPU) was formed to develop the sourcing strategy and deliver a new framework agreement (framework).

1.4 As part of the sourcing strategy developed the Framework was split into 19 distinct lots. These lots are as follows:-

Lot	Description
1	Swimming Lessons
2	8 to 16 Seaters – Glasgow South
3	17 to 26 Seaters – Glasgow South
4	27 to 40 Seaters – Glasgow South
5	41 to 54 Seaters – Glasgow South
6	55 to 69 Seaters – Glasgow South
7	70(+) Seaters and Double Decker Buses – Glasgow South
8	8 to 16 Seaters – Glasgow Northwest
9	17 to 26 Seaters – Glasgow Northwest
10	27 to 40 Seaters – Glasgow Northwest
11	41 to 54 Seaters – Glasgow Northwest
12	55 to 69 Seaters – Glasgow Northwest
13	70(+) Seaters and Double Decker Buses – Glasgow Northwest
14	8 to 16 Seaters – Glasgow Northeast
15	17 to 26 Seaters – Glasgow Northeast

16	27 to 40 Seaters – Glasgow Northeast
17	41 to 54 Seaters – Glasgow Northeast
18	55 to 69 Seaters – Glasgow Northeast
19	70(+) Seaters and Double Decker Buses – Glasgow Northeast

1.5 It was agreed that an open tender process would be the most appropriate method to deliver this Framework. The opportunity was advertised via Find a Tender.

1.6 The duration of the Framework is for three years, commencing 4th January 2023, with an option to extend for a further period of up to 12 months, subject to funding.

1.7 The Purchase to pay route is via PECOS catalogue.

1.8 The Framework is open to all council service areas and ALEOs.

2 Evaluation

2.1 6 suppliers submitted a Single Procurement Document which covers the pre-selection questions/stage of the open tender evaluation. Of the 6, 3 failed to submit a technical and commercial response for any of the Lots and were deemed non-compliant. Of the remaining 3 suppliers, 2 submitted responses for all Lots with the remaining supplier bidding for Lots 10 to 19 only.

2.2 The award evaluation was based on the following criteria and weightings:-

Lot	Price	Quality	Quality Sub Criteria
All Lots	80%	20%	Operational 5%
			Sustainability 10%
			Fair Work First (including the Glasgow Living Wage) 5%
			Health & Safety Assessment – Pass / Fail
			Operator Licence – Pass / Fail

2.3 With the exception of Lot 1, which will be awarded to a single supplier, all other Lots will be awarded on a ranked basis for journeys within the Glasgow area only. Any journey requirements out with the Glasgow boundary will be awarded via Mini-Competition.

2.4 The evaluation of award scoring, estimated award value and ranking of the suppliers which have been recommended for award, within each respective lot, is shown in the table below:

Lot	Description	Supplier	Total Evaluation Score	Value (per annum)	Rank
1	Swimming	Doigs Limited	99.4	£320,424	1
2	8 to 16 seaters Glasgow South	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
3	17 to 26 seaters - Glasgow South	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
4	27 to 40 seaters - Glasgow South	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
		Craig of Campbeltown	57.75	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	2
5	41 to 54 seaters - Glasgow South	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
		Craig of Campbeltown	68.62	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	2
6	55 to 69 seaters - Glasgow South	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
		Craig of Campbeltown	64.9	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	2
7	70(+) seaters and Double Decker Buses - Glasgow South	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
		Craig of Campbeltown	75.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	2
8	8 to 16 seaters - Glasgow North West	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1

9	17 to 26 seaters - Glasgow North West	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
10	27 to 40 seaters - Glasgow North West	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
		Allander Coaches Limited	90.87	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	2
		Craig of Campbeltown	57.59	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	3
11	41 to 54 seaters - Glasgow North West	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
		Allander Coaches Limited	87.68	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	2
		Craig of Campbeltown	68.62	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	3
12	55 to 69 seaters - Glasgow North West	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
		Allander Coaches Limited	90.31	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	2
		Craig of Campbeltown	64.9	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	3
13	70(+) seaters and Double Decker Buses - Glasgow North West	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
		Allander Coaches Limited	91.26	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	2

		Craig of Campbeltown	75.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	3
14	8 to 16 seaters - Glasgow North East	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
15	17 to 26 seaters - Glasgow North East	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
16	27 to 40 seaters - Glasgow North East	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
		Allander Coaches Limited	90.87	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	2
		Craig of Campbeltown	57.59	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	3
17	41 to 54 seaters - Glasgow North East	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
		Allander Coaches Limited	84.11	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	2
		Craig of Campbeltown	68.62	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	3
18	55 to 69 seaters - Glasgow North East	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
		Allander Coaches Limited	89.96	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	2
		Craig of Campbeltown	64.71	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	3

19	70(+) seaters and Double Decker Buses - Glasgow North East	Doigs Limited	99.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	1
		Allander Coaches Limited	91.26	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	2
		Craig of Campbeltown	75.4	Lots 2 – 19 combined is estimated at £580,000	3

A summary of the unsuccessful tender evaluation results can be found at Appendix A.

2.5 The rates specific to Lot 1 – swimming has reduced compared to historic rates paid on average in previous years. This equates to an estimated annual saving of approximately £14,196 (4%). The savings figure is an estimate based on the ad-hoc ordering and the variety of coach hire suppliers utilised over previous years and the average rates paid by schools for services specific to swimming lessons.

2.6 For Lots 2 – 19, the hire rates submitted by the ranked 1 supplier recommended for award have increased by an estimated £74,292 (14.7%) on average. Given the uniqueness of each journey and the ad-hoc nature of the requirements we do not hold the appropriate level of management information to accurately calculate this percentage figure and is therefore an estimation based on the information we currently hold.

2.7 As part of this Framework, PECOS catalogues will be available for users to utilise which should improve our management information, over the duration of this Framework, allowing the CPU to monitor usage and highlight any impacts on budgets.

2.8 As with any Framework there is no guarantee of business for the supplier and the majority of requirements will be ad-hoc, with the exception of Lot 1. Service area spend and requirements will be monitored on a regular basis.

2.9 Each service area will monitor the supplier's day to day operational performance based on its requirements. Overall contract and supplier performance will be managed by the CPU.

3 Policy and Resource Implications

Resource Implications:

Financial: The annual estimated award value of £900,424, totaling £3,601,696 over the 4 years duration of

	the Framework, will be met by the service areas revenue budgets. The rates specific to Lot 1 – swimming equates to an estimated annual saving of approximately £14,196 (4%), as set out in paragraph 2.5. The hire rates submitted by the ranked 1 supplier for Lots 2 – 19 represent an estimated increase of £74,292 (14.7%) on average, as set out in paragraph 2.6.
Legal:	The report raises no new legal issues. The Director of Legal and Administration will be responsible for concluding the Framework.
Personnel:	No direct personnel implications.
Procurement:	Open tender process as detailed in section 1.5.
Equality and Socio-Economic Impacts: *Does the proposal support the Council's Equality Outcomes 2021-25*	The proposal supports best practice in the procurement of services.
What are the potential equality impacts as a result of this report?	None
Please highlight if the policy/proposal will help address socio economic disadvantage.	Fair Work First was included as part of the award criteria with a weighting of 5%. The suppliers recommended for appointment to the Framework confirmed: Allander Coaches Limited • Pays the Real Living Wage • Do not utilise zero hours contracts • Training and Development opportunities • Modern Apprenticeships • Flexible working • Employee Voice Craig of Campbeltown • Do not utilise zero hours contracts • Training and Development opportunities • Consideration of Flexible Working

- Apprenticeship Scheme

Doigs Limited

- Pays its employees in excess of the Real Living Wage
- Do not utilise zero hours contracts
- Recognition of trade unions
- Training and Development opportunities
- Oppose fire and re-hire policies
- Flexible working

Community Benefits were included as a mandatory requirement.

The suppliers recommended for appointment to the Framework have offered a range of community benefits. The delivery of the outcomes will be based on the level of spend with each of the suppliers i.e. outcomes will be delivered by the supplier if the spend with them reaches any of the five thresholds.

Lot 1
Minimum requirement of 40 points – Supplier recommended for award has offered outcomes worth 90 points

- New Employee - Full Time Job (from Priority Group) x 2
- New Employee - Full Time Job (non Priority Group) x 1
- Community Engagement - Financial Support (minimum £1k) x 1
- Community Engagement - Non-Financial Support (min. 5 hrs.) x 1

Lots 2 – 19
Threshold 1 £50K to £100K

- New Employee - Full Time Job (from Priority Group)
- New Employee - Part Time Job (from Priority Group)
- Work Experience Placement - Foundation Apprenticeship
- Career Event
- Workplace Visit
- Community Engagement - Financial Support (minimum £1k)
- Community Engagement - Non-Financial Support (min. 5 hrs.)

Threshold 2 £100K to £250K

- New Employee - Full Time Job (from Priority Group)
- New Employee - Part Time Job (from Priority Group)
- Community Engagement - Non-Financial Support (min. 5 hrs.)

Threshold 3 £250K to £500K

- New Employee - Full Time Job (from Priority Group)
- New Employee - Full Time Job (non Priority Group)
- New Employee - Part Time Job (from Priority Group)
- New Employee - Part Time Job (non Priority Group)
- Apprentice New Start - Part Time (from Priority Group)

Threshold 4 £500K to £1m

- New Employee - Full Time Job (from Priority Group)
- New Employee - Full Time Job (non Priority Group)
- New Employee - Part Time Job (from Priority Group)
- New Employee - Part Time Job (non Priority Group)
- Apprentice New Start - Part Time (from Priority Group)
- Community Engagement - Financial Support (minimum £1k)

Threshold 5 £1m to £3m

- New Employee - Full Time Job (from Priority Group)
- New Employee - Full Time Job (non Priority Group)
- New Employee - Part Time Job (from Priority Group)
- New Employee - Part Time Job (non Priority Group)
- Apprentice New Start - Part Time (from Priority Group)
- Community Engagement - Financial Support (minimum £1k)

Climate Impacts:	
Does the proposal support any Climate Plan actions? Please specify:	As part of the award criteria 2 scored sustainability questions were included. One was in relation to the supplier's compliance with the Low Emission Zone, supporting the council's ambitions of becoming carbon neutral by 2030 and creating a circular economy within the city. The other question was scored based on the bidder's fleet i.e. zero emissions, Euro 6, Euro 5 etc.
What are the potential climate impacts as a result of this proposal?	In relation to lot 1 – swimming, awarding to a single supplier will result in a reduction of vehicles on the road to deliver this service. There may also be opportunities for improved route optimisation which may further reduce journeys or reduce mileage.
Will the proposal contribute to Glasgow's net zero carbon target?	No
Privacy and Data Protection impacts:	No data protection impacts identified.

4 Recommendations

The Contracts and Property Committee is requested to approve the award of a framework agreement for coach and mini-bus hire to the suppliers listed below and as set out in the table within 2.4

Allander Coaches Limited
Companies House Number – SC052213

Doigs Limited
Companies House Number – SC133128

Craig of Campbeltown Limited
Companies House Number – SC033868

Appendix A – Unsuccessful Supplier

Lot	Supplier	Score	Rank
1 – Swimming	Craig of Campbeltown Companies House Number – SC033868	67.65	2